



Report Identification Number: SV-17-056

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Apr 27, 2018

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation		



Case Information

Report Type: Child Found Alive
Age: 17 year(s)

Jurisdiction: Westchester
Gender: Male

Date of Death: Unknown
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 11/21/2017

Presenting Information

An SCR report alleged the 16-year-old male child had been residing with his grandmother and uncle since 2010. The child was allegedly murdered by his uncle during the weekend of 11/18/17 to 11/19/17. The child had been repeatedly beaten, raped, sexually abused, and sex trafficked by the uncle since 2014. The grandmother was aware the child had been sex trafficked for years and allowed it to continue. The grandmother was also aware the child had been murdered and failed to take action. The mother had an unknown role.

Executive Summary

Westchester County Department of Social Services (WCDSS) received the above SCR report on 11/21/17. It was determined the 16-year-old child was alive and well. The child was safe in the care of his paternal grandmother and father. The uncle who allegedly murdered the child did not live in New York state and rarely sees the child. The child has repeatedly denied he has ever been sex trafficked and physically or sexually abused.

Between 7/7/14 and 9/14/17 there have been approximately 13 similar reports, all unfounded due to lack of any credible evidence. Each time, WCDSS initiated the investigation within 24 hours, found the child to be safe in the care of the father and PGM, interviewed all alleged subjects, the child, and collaterals. LE and the DA have been notified of the false reporting and they were unable to take any legal action.

The allegations of DOA/Fatality and Sexual Abuse against the uncle and grandmother were unsubstantiated. The case was unfounded and closed on 12/28/17 as the child was alive and well. The child showed frustration over another false report being made.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:**
 - **Safety assessment due at the time of determination?** Yes

Determination:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?** Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- **Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?** Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Yes



Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

The casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	16 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	45 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Grandparent	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	68 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Mother	No Role	Female	43 Year(s)
Other Household 2	Aunt/Uncle	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	36 Year(s)

LDSS Response

On 11/21/17, WCDSS received the fatality report from the SCR. WCDSS initiated their investigation within 24 hours and coordinated efforts with LE. The caseworker (CW) contacted the child's school and verified that he was in class at the time. The child's school had no concerns for his well being or safety.

CW and LE made a joint home visit after the child returned home from school. The grandmother and child were interviewed and expressed frustration with the repeated false reports made against them. The child reported to be okay and doing well in school. The child expressed no concerns for his safety and liked being in the care of his grandmother.

A sex trafficking assessment tool was completed on 12/4/17 and there were no safety factors flagged.

On 12/6/17, CW received LE reports. There was an incident on 5/1/15 where the child's mother was charged with criminal contempt. The mother stood on the grandmother's doorstep for 30 minutes knocking and ringing the doorbell demanding to see the child. On 5/12/15, the grandmother went to the police to make a report against the mother stating she was violating an order of protection that was in place by repeatedly calling her on the phone. The mother was to have no contact with the grandmother. This was referred to the DA's office.

On 12/8/17, CW made another home visit and spoke with the child, his father, and grandmother who all reported everything was fine and there were no safety concerns.

The child had been in the care of his grandmother since 2010 due to the mother having mental health issues and being



incapable of providing a minimum degree of care for him. The mother has a history of homelessness. Efforts were made to contact the mother but were unsuccessful. The uncle had been contacted in the past when he was named in reports and denied the allegations. He lived out of state and rarely had contact with the child. The uncle would not return phone calls and contact from WCDSS.

The case was unfounded and closed on 12/28/17.

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
045239 - Deceased Child, Male, 16 Year(s)	045238 - Grandparent, Female, 68 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
045239 - Deceased Child, Male, 16 Year(s)	045238 - Grandparent, Female, 68 Year(s)	Sexual Abuse	Unsubstantiated
045239 - Deceased Child, Male, 16 Year(s)	045241 - Aunt/Uncle, Male, 36 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
045239 - Deceased Child, Male, 16 Year(s)	045241 - Aunt/Uncle, Male, 36 Year(s)	Sexual Abuse	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Additional information:



Child Fatality Report

The uncle was not contacted as he does not reside in the state of New York and has infrequent contact with the child. The uncle has denied allegations in false reports in the past.

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? No

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? Yes
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death? No
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? No

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
09/14/2017	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Male, 43 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Male, 43 Years	Burns / Scalding	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Male, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Female, 45 Years	Burns / Scalding	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Female, 45 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Other Adult - Alleged Parent Sub, Female, 45 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the parent substitutes hit SC and inflicted bruises on his body. The adults also inflicted burns on him as well. The situation was ongoing. The roles of the mother and the adult sibling were unknown.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 10/18/2017

Basis for Determination:

SC was in the custody of his grandmother at the time this report was made. SC and the grandmother had no knowledge of the people named as alleged subjects. WCDSS regularly met with SC throughout this investigation and did not observe any obvious signs of abuse or maltreatment. SC denied having any knowledge of the people named as the alleged subjects.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and made the appropriate determination.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
--------------------	-------------------	------------------------	---------------	----------------	---------------------



08/26/2017	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Grandparent, Female, 67 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Grandparent, Female, 67 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

The report alleged SC was developmentally disabled and unable to hear. Two years ago, the guardian gave SC to be sold for sexual favors. SC was being sexually abused on an ongoing basis. SC had been injected with drugs and hit. It was unknown if SC sustained injuries from being hit. It was unknown what drugs SC was injected with. The guardian would not allow SC to return to the home and failed to make an adequate plan for SC. The role of the mother was unknown.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 10/25/2017

Basis for Determination:

WCDSS did not discover any credible evidence to substantiate the allegations. SC, his father, and grandmother (the guardian) all denied the allegations. SC appeared safe in the care of his grandmother, he received high honors in school, and displayed no visible signs of abuse/maltreatment.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed an accurate and thorough investigation.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
12/07/2016	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Grandparent, Female, 67 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 37 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 37 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Grandparent, Female, 67 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 35 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 35 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the paternal aunt and her husband sold SC to a sex trafficking ring and he was being prostituted. The paternal grandmother was aware of the criminal act but failed to intervene. The child had been gone from the grandmother's home for the past year.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 12/28/2016

Basis for Determination:

SC was seen, interviewed, and denied the allegations. SC was very frustrated by the numerous false reports. SC felt safe in the care of his grandmother. There was no credible evidence the child was ever missing, sold to a sex trafficking ring or had been prostituted.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed an accurate and thorough investigation and made the appropriate determination.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No



Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
11/14/2016	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 35 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 35 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the uncle kidnapped and held SC for sex trafficking purposes. The role of the mother was unknown.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 11/22/2016

Basis for Determination:

There was a long history of false reports being called in on this family. The grandmother, father, uncle, and child denied the allegations were true. The uncle lived out of state. The mother had been chronically homeless and was unable to be contacted. WCDSS found no credible evidence to substantiate the allegations.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and made the appropriate determination.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
08/31/2016	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Father, Male, 44 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Father, Male, 44 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Father, Male, 44 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 15 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

The grandmother had custody of SC and it was alleged she facilitated and knowingly allowed SC to be sexually abused and tortured by his uncle and various other individuals involved in a sex traffic ring. As a result, SC was injected with heroin, tattooed, had pieces of his spine removed, was forced to ingest rat poison, and was sodomized regularly for the past 5 years. The father was aware of the situation but failed to intervene. The mother had an unknown role.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 09/19/2016



Basis for Determination:

WCDSS met with SC, his grandmother, and his father and all denied the allegations.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and obtained no credible evidence to substantiate the allegations.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
03/11/2016	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Educational Neglect	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 66 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Internal Injuries	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

The grandmother was the guardian for SC. It was alleged the grandmother was aware that two adult uncles had sexually abused SC at different times and sex trafficked SC and she allowed this to happen. The uncles were involved in having 4 fingers and 5 toes of SC cut off and having him shot. The uncles were also involved in SC's nose being cut off. The most recent alleged molestation happened about 2 weeks prior to this case. The uncles have acted as regular and consistent caretakers for the child. The grandmother was aware the child had not attended school at all for the past 2 years. The mother had an unknown role.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 03/24/2016

Basis for Determination:

All alleged subjects and SC were interviewed and strongly denied the allegations. The mother had a long history of psychiatric hospitalizations and failing to follow recommended treatment plans. WCDSS observed the child to have all of



his fingers and his nose. SC has infrequent contact with his uncles and denied he has ever been sexually abused by them or anyone else.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and had no credible evidence to substantiate the allegations. The source had been told numerous times by various people to stop making false reports and she continued to do so.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
10/28/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 33 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the grandmother was aware and allowed 2 uncles to rape and have sex with SC. The uncles had frequent and regular contact with SC and were found in SC's home on a regular basis. SC visited the one uncle's home on weekends. The other uncle was using heroin and injecting SC with heroin. Mother had an unknown role.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 11/25/2015

Basis for Determination:

All alleged subjects and SC were interviewed and strongly denied the allegations.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation, interviewed all parties, and did not have credible evidence to substantiate the allegations. The child remained safe in the care of his grandmother and father.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
09/22/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Male, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	



Child Fatality Report

Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded
Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded
Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Male, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded
Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded

Report Summary:

The grandmother was selling the child for the purposes of sex trafficking. This began two years ago after the grandmother was given custody. A few weeks prior to this report, grandmother allegedly sold the child to an adult couple. The child had been in their care and they had been sexually abusing the child.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 10/15/2015

Basis for Determination:

WCDSS addressed the allegations with the child, grandmother, and his father and they all strongly denied the allegations. The family stated they have learned to deal with the source repeatedly making false reports with the same allegations. The family had sought legal assistance for the harassing phone calls but this has proven unsuccessful.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and did not obtain credible evidence to substantiate the allegations. WCDSS made diligent efforts to locate the mother but these were unsuccessful.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
09/16/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Male, 65 Years	Burns / Scalding	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Female, 65 Years	Burns / Scalding	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Male, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Male, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - unrelated adult, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 14 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the grandmother sold SC to a couple for the purpose of trafficking the child. The child was being sexually assaulted and raped by the couple as well as by many other adults. The grandmother was aware of this. The couple also burned the child with cigarettes.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 10/16/2015

**Basis for Determination:**

Grandmother has had custody of SC since 2010. There had been numerous false reports made with the same allegations. Child denied the allegations were true. There was an order of protection for the child against his mother.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS did a thorough investigation and did not obtain any credible evidence. Child remained safe in the care of his grandmother.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
04/03/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the grandmother sold SC to a couple who were sexually abusing him, hitting him, and burning him. There was no information regarding specific injuries to the child. The roles of mother and father were unknown.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 05/08/2015

Basis for Determination:

Child and his family denied the allegations. Collateral contacts had no concerns for the child in the care of his grandmother.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and encouraged the grandmother to seek assistance from the DA's office and the police department to address her concerns that she was being harassed by the numerous false CPS reports.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
03/08/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

Grandmother had custody of SC and it was alleged that for approximately 1 year, she had been selling SC to pedophiles for the purpose of molesting him.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 03/19/2015

Basis for Determination:

SC denied he had ever been molested or that his grandmother was selling him to pedophiles. This was the 6th CPS investigation since July 2014 with the same allegations. The grandmother was granted a stay away order of protection from the child's mother due to the mother harassing her.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and appropriately deemed the child to be safe in the care of his grandmother.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No



Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
02/05/2015	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Father, Male, 43 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Grandparent, Female, 65 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	
	Deceased Child, Male, 13 Years	Father, Male, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

It was alleged the father and grandmother were using SC in a child pornography and child prostitution ring and were sexually abusing him. Mother had an unknown role.

Determination: Unfounded

Date of Determination: 02/26/2015

Basis for Determination:

This was the 5th investigation since August 2014 with the same allegations from the same source of the report. The source repeatedly made false reports with the same allegations. SC, grandmother, and father denied all allegations. Mother had mental health issues and was frequently homeless and could not be contacted.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a complete and thorough investigation and appropriately deemed the SC was safe in the care of his grandmother and father.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

- 6/9/09-7/21/09 UNF allegation of IF/C/S against BM for SC and SS (now an adult)
- 8/10/10-10/4/10 IND allegation of IG against BM for SC and IG & LS for SS.
- 7/7/14-8/14/14 UNF allegations of IG and SXAB against PGM, BF, and PA.
- 9/14/14-10/7/14 UNF allegations of IG and SXAB against PGM, PU and PA.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known CPS history outside of NYS.

Preventive Services History

10/1/10-2/18/15 This case was opened as the result of mother leaving her then 16yo daughter (SS) home alone while she and SC left for North Carolina. The mother did not make a plan of care for the 16yo SS and the mother had no friends or relatives in NC, and as a result, she and SC ended up in a homeless shelter. Upon their return to NY, the mother met with CW and explained a neglect petition would be filed and she agreed to preventive services. The mother had a history of non-compliance with MH treatment. WCDSS feared the mother would stop attending her treatment once the CPS case was closed. A preventive case was opened in order to provide further supervision and monitoring.

Foster Care Placement History



On 11/24/10, the mother was involuntarily hospitalized based on her bizarre statements and physically attacking SS. SC and SS were removed from their mother's care on this date and placed with SC's paternal grandmother. A full stay away order of protection was put in place until the next court date on 1/31/11. Counseling services were provided to both children. The SS went to live in Children's Village Supervised Living Program. SS decided to sign herself out of care when she was 20. SC remained in the custody of his PGM. SC's father was developmentally delayed and not capable of providing adequate care of him.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation?

Family Court

Criminal Court

Order of Protection

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes

From: Unknown

To: 04/29/2019

Explain:

There is an order of protection in place for the grandmother against the mother.

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No